

City of Austin Disparity Study Public Webinar

**Colette Holt & Associates
Cultural Strategies, Inc.
Pink Consulting
Adisa Public Relations, Inc.**

16 April 2020

Disparity Study Team

■ Colette Holt & Associates

- Colette Holt, J.D. - Project Manager
 - Nationally recognized expert, educator and author on M/W/DBE issues
- Steven Pitts, Ph.D. - Economist and Statistician
 - Nationally recognized expert, educator and author on market issues regarding minorities for over 30 years
- Joanne Lubart, J.D. - Associate Counsel
 - National expert DBE programs
- Glenn Sullivan - Director of Technology
 - Extensive experience with CHA data collection and website management

Disparity Study Team, cont.

- Ilene Grossman, B.A. - Assistant Project Manager/COO
 - Experienced manager of disparity studies
- Victoria Farrell, M.B.A. – Anecdotal Team Manager
 - Experienced researcher and data manager
- Carol Borst - Contract Data Collection Team Manager
 - Experienced coordinator of all contract data collection activities

Disparity Study Team, cont.

- Local subconsultants
 - Will assist with community outreach and anecdotal data collection
 - Cultural Strategies, Inc. (MBE)
 - Provides communications and outreach support for civic projects and education campaigns for local institutions and private enterprises
 - Pink Consulting (M/WBE)
 - Provides communications, strategic planning, marketing, fundraising and event/conference planning and coordination services
 - Adisa Public Relations, Inc. (M/WBE)
 - Provides public involvement and communications services for public, private and not-for-profits sectors

Disparity Study Objectives

- Comply with constitutional mandate to regularly review evidence supporting race- and gender-based programs
- Comply with regulatory requirements for the DBE program at the Airport
- Provide a defense if the programs are challenged
- Develop accurate data for annual and contract goal setting
- Gather feedback for program improvements
- Educate elected officials, City staff, assist agencies, and business owners on these issues

Disparity Study Elements

- Study website
 - Home page
 - Meet Our Team
 - Participate
 - Contact Us & Public Comment
- Legal Review
- City's utilization of M/WBEs and DBEs as a percentage of all dollars by funding source
 - Study period is FY 2013 to FY 2018
 - Step 1: Gather the City's prime contracts to create Initial Contract Data Files

Disparity Study Elements

- Step 2: Gather any additional data for contracts in the Sample Contract Data Files
- Step 3: Contact primes for missing subcontractor data
 - Collect at least 80% of the contract dollars
 - Assign missing race and gender ownership status
 - Assign missing NAICS codes
- Step 4: Determine geographic and product markets
 - Determine the unconstrained product market
 - Analyze data for primes, subs and combined
 - Determine the geographic market for at least 75% of the contracts
 - Determine product market constrained by geographic market
 - Determine detailed utilization by race, gender and 6-digit NAICS codes

Disparity Study Elements

- Availability of M/W/DBEs in the City's markets
 - Create Master List of M/W/DBEs from multiple entities
 - Develop list from the Contract Data Files and other City lists
 - Obtain Hoovers/Dun & Bradstreet for initial business universe
 - Assign missing race and gender status and NAICS codes
 - Estimate detailed, unweighted and weighted availability combined and disaggregated by race, gender and industry codes

Disparity Study Elements

- Disparity analysis for locally funded contracts
 - Disparity ratio = M/WBE utilization ÷ weighted availability
 - 80% or less is substantive, supporting the inference of discrimination
 - Confidence intervals for statistical significance
 - Calculate disparity indices for:
 - All race and sex groups and all industry groups combined, and race and sex disaggregated

Disparity Study Elements

- Economy-wide disparity analyses
 - Compare M/WBEs' revenues to non-M/WBEs' using the Census Bureau's Survey of Business Owners
 - Compare M/WBEs' formation rates and business earnings to non-M/WBEs' using the Census Bureau's American Community Survey
 - Critical for evaluation of effectiveness of race- and gender-neutral measures

Disparity Study Elements

- Anecdotal data collection and analysis
 - Small group business owner interviews
 - M/W/DBEs and non-M/W/DBEs
 - Explore
 - Barriers to M/W/DBEs' success in the Austin area markets
 - Experiences with discrimination
 - Ability to access City prime and subcontracts
 - Possible supportive services or other race- and gender-neutral measures
 - Administer electronic survey to all business owners
 - City of Austin staff interviews

Disparity Study Elements

- M/WBE and DBE Program Review
 - Review policy/program documents
 - Solicit stakeholders', business owners' and City staff's suggestions
 - Topics will include:
 - Outreach to M/W/DBEs and small firms
 - Program elements
 - Certification standards and processes
 - Annual and contract goal setting
 - Review of bids/proposals
 - Contract monitoring, including commercially useful function evaluations and sub substitutions
 - Small business element for DBE program
 - Barriers to City contracting and subcontracting
 - Contract data collection and reporting processes

Disparity Study Elements

- Recommendations
 - Race- and gender-neutral measures to reduce barriers and increase opportunities
 - DBE triennial goals and contract goal setting methodology
 - Potential narrowly tailored race- and gender-conscious remedies for locally-funded contracts
 - Program eligibility
 - Annual M/WBE goals
 - Contract goal setting methodology
 - Bid/proposal evaluation
 - Contract performance policies and processes
 - Monitoring and data collection

Study Participation Information

- Business owner interviews September 2020
- Electronic survey of business owners October-November 2020
- Study information
 - <http://austin.disparity-study.com>
 - austin-study@mwbelaw.com
 - 855-692-3529 (855-MWBELAW)
- City of Austin
 - Edward Campos, Interim Director, SMBR
Edward.Campos@austintexas.gov (512) 974-7206
 - Tamela Saldana, Study Manager
DisparityStudy@austintexas.gov 512-974-7844



16 Carriage Hills • San Antonio, Texas 78257

773.255.6844 • colette.holt@mwbelaw.com

www.mwbelaw.com • Twitter: [@mwbelaw](https://twitter.com/mwbelaw)